

## Message

**From:** Buelig, Mattias [Mattias.Buelig@fcs-feinchemie.com]  
**Sent:** 7/19/2012 10:18:12 AM  
**To:** GUSTIN, CHRISTOPHE [AG/5040] [/O=MONSANTO/OU=EA-5041-01/cn=Recipients/cn=83930]; Pepita Duran [duran@gtaduran.com]; GARNETT, RICHARD P [AG/5040] [/O=MONSANTO/OU=EA-5041-01/cn=Recipients/cn=107838]; sylvain.gautier@arystalifescience.com; 'Annette Salomonsen' [annette.salomonsen@cheminova.com]; CARONE@dow.com; eric.gibert@at.nufarm.com; nikolaus.zenz@syngenta.com; egay@afresa.es; mihailova@agria.bg; 'Bob Nicholls' [Bob.Nicholls@Laronkarn.co.uk]; a.lang@agrotrade.de; jward@etracom.com; c.vanesbroeck@agrilechem.nl; ian@barclay.ie; 'Slawomir Kijowski' [slawomir.kijowski@bros.pl]; ravikumar@excelcropcare.com; f.thuerwaechter@helmag.com; franka.peric@pinus-tki.si; ftoubac@rotam.com; 'Shalaka Shelar' [shalaka.shelar@sabero.com]; monique.bourdin@sfp-rd.com; npear@uk.exponent.com; aduarte@agro.sapec.pt; bgoswami@uniphos.com; tina\_wang@wynca.com  
**CC:** 'Martyn Hargraves' [t9c@live.co.uk]; GRAHAM, WILLIAM [AG/5432] [/O=MONSANTO/OU=EA-5040-01/cn=Recipients/cn=233911]; HEYDENS, WILLIAM F [AG/1000] [/O=MONSANTO/OU=NA-1000-01/cn=Recipients/cn=230737]; SALTMIRAS, DAVID A [AG/1000] [/O=MONSANTO/OU=NA-1000-01/cn=Recipients/cn=DASALT]; GARNETT, RICHARD P [AG/5040] [/O=MONSANTO/OU=EA-5041-01/cn=Recipients/cn=107838]  
**Subject:** AW: Genotox Review: your approval requested!

Dear Christophe,

FCS agrees to the additional costs as well.

Best regards,

Mattias

**Von:** GUSTIN, CHRISTOPHE (AG/5040) [mailto:christophe.gustin@monsanto.com]

**Gesendet:** Mittwoch, 18. Juli 2012 19:12

**An:** GUSTIN, CHRISTOPHE (AG/5040); Pepita Duran; GARNETT, RICHARD P (AG/5040); sylvain.gautier@arystalifescience.com; 'Annette Salomonsen'; CARONE@dow.com; Buelig, Mattias; eric.gibert@at.nufarm.com; nikolaus.zenz@syngenta.com; egay@afresa.es; mihailova@agria.bg; 'Bob Nicholls'; a.lang@agrotrade.de; jward@etracom.com; c.vanesbroeck@agrilechem.nl; ian@barclay.ie; 'Slawomir Kijowski'; ravikumar@excelcropcare.com; f.thuerwaechter@helmag.com; franka.peric@pinus-tki.si; ftoubac@rotam.com; 'Shalaka Shelar'; monique.bourdin@sfp-rd.com; npear@uk.exponent.com; aduarte@agro.sapec.pt; bgoswami@uniphos.com; tina\_wang@wynca.com

**Cc:** 'Martyn Hargraves'; GRAHAM, WILLIAM (AG/5432); HEYDENS, WILLIAM F (AG/1000); SALTMIRAS, DAVID A (AG/1000); GARNETT, RICHARD P (AG/5040)

**Betreff:** Genotox Review: your approval requested!

**Wichtigkeit:** Hoch

URGENT REQUEST

---

Dear RWG,

As part of the GTF literature review the RWG and Board agreed to ask Larry Kier (former Monsanto expert and now independent consultant) to write a genotox review paper on technical glyphosate and glyphosate based Plant Protection Products. This paper would pool data from confidential Taskforce Member studies which was the reason why David Saltmiras (MON), chair to the tox-TWG, stepped down as a co-author for this paper. In addition when trying to combine both reviews (on technical glyphosate and PPPs) the manuscript turned into such a large mess of studies reporting genotoxic effects, that the story as written stretched the limits of credibility among less sophisticated audiences. For most 'stories', the approach would have been fine. But even though we feel confident that glyphosate is not genotoxic, this became a very difficult story to tell given all the complicated 'noise' out there. So David Saltmiras, Larry Kier and Bill Heydens consulted by other Monsanto tox experts thought there was a need to re-group & redesign the approach to the manuscript.

The suggested approach was to split-up the reviews in 2 papers (one on tech glyphosate and one on PPPs). In addition it was suggested that one way to help enhance credibility is to have an additional author on the papers who is a renowned specialist in the area of genotoxicity. Larry Kier did a search for possible co-authors and came up with 5. After internal discussion and some checking by David Saltmiras with fellow TWG tox folks (see extracts from TWG-meeting minutes below), Dr. David Kirkland was identified as the best candidate.

David Kirkland is an independent consultant with a history at Covance Laboratories. He is an expert in 'COMET'-assays on PPPs and is member of the editorial board for 'Mutagen Research' and member of the Environmental Mutagen Society in the UK. David Kirkland would most definitely add substantial expertise and credibility to this critical paper.

The initial cost estimate for this manuscript was 9k\$ (approved by the board).

Adding David Kirkland as a co-author to both review papers would add £14,000 (pounds Stirling) to the project, which split by 25 seems a fair investment.

Please let me know as soon as possible if we have your support to proceed with David Kirkland as a co-author. We need a decision soon since David Kirkland only has the month of August to work on the papers.

David, Bill, please let me know if I missed or misinterpreted something.

Best regards,

Christophe.

**From:** SALTMIRAS, DAVID A [AG/1000]  
**Sent:** Wednesday, July 18, 2012 4:54 PM  
**To:** GUSTIN, CHRISTOPHE [AG/5040]  
**Subject:** RE: Genotox Review

Christophe,

Below are extracts from recent meeting minutes this month. David Kirkland was discussed as a strong candidate to coauthor on July 2<sup>nd</sup> and ToxTWG endorsed him on July 16<sup>th</sup> and plans to engage him were put in motion.

- From July 2<sup>nd</sup>

- a. Genotoxicity review manuscript.

- i. Discussed approaches for literature and data reviews
    - ii. Consensus gained for two companion papers on active ingredient and formulated product genotoxicity data (GTF member company data and peer reviewed publications)
    - iii. **Co-authors with Larry Kier were discussed. David Kirkland was proposed as strong candidate for this role.** Syngenta proposed Barry Elliott, expressing possible bias towards COMET assay data by David Kirkland. Simon will inquire within the Syngenta genotox group on suitability of David Kirkland to provide an objective scientific review including weight of evidence for the full data set (GTF member study reports and peer reviewed publications).
      - **NOTE:** Larry had contacted David Kirkland yesterday to discuss the paper and Larry contacted David Saltmiras today (Tuesday July 3<sup>rd</sup>) to debrief.
      - Larry is convinced that David Kirkland will provide a strong technical skill set to evaluate the breadth of data including the COMET data (weighing convenience of